## VIRGINIA FAIR HOUSING BOARD

## MINUTES OF MEETING

September 29, 2010

The Fair Housing Board Meeting was held at the Department of Professional and Occupational Regulation, 9960 Mayland Drive, Richmond, Virginia. The following Board members were present:

David B. Rubinstein, Chairman Tonye Epps Jeffrey Adkins Martin Maples Jim Ginnell Matthew K. Kim Andrew Reisinger F. Thomas Eck, IV

Board members not present: Rosario Carrera

Neil Bhatt Phyllis Randall

DPOR Staff present for all or part of the meeting included:

Gordon Dixon, Director
Nicholas Christner, Deputy Director
Mark Courtney, Deputy Director
Christine Martine, Executive Director
Liz Hayes, Fair Housing Administrator
Deanda Shelton, Assistant Fair Housing Administrator
Emily Trent, Administrative Assistant
Angela Keefe-Thomas, Fair Housing Investigator
Annie Wilson, Fair Housing Specialist
Karen Taylor, Fair Housing Specialist
Matt Vincent, Fair Housing Investigator

Tom Payne, Assistant Attorney General with the Office of the Attorney General, was present.

Chairman Rubinstein called the meeting to order at 10:05 <u>Call to Order</u> A.M.

A motion was made by Ms. Epps and seconded by Mr. Agenda Maples to approve the Agenda. The motion passed

unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Adkins, Eck, Epps, Ginnell, Kim, Maples, Reisinger and Rubinstein.

A motion was made by Mr. Maples and seconded by Ms. Epps to approve the July 27, 2010, Regulatory Review Committee Meeting minutes. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Adkins, Eck, Epps, Ginnell, Kim, Maples, Reisinger and Rubinstein.

A motion was made by Mr. Maples and seconded by Ms. Epps to approve the July 28, 2010, Fair Housing Board Meeting minutes. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Adkins, Eck, Epps, Ginnell, Kim, Maples, Reisinger and Rubinstein.

There was no public comment.

Liz Hayes updated the Board on the current investigative case load.

In the matter of FHB File Number 2010-01052, Vicki FHB File Number 2010-Wells v. Kenneth Saunders, the Board deferred the matter to the December 8, 2010, Board meeting.

In the matter of FHB File Number 2010-05358, Thomas Schott v. Ursula Fletcher, Edgewood Management Corporation, Mercury **Associates Limited** and Partnership, the Board reviewed the record which Edgewood Management consisted of the Final Investigative Report and Case Analysis and Recommendation and Supplemental Final Investigative Report. Yoora Pak, attorney for the respondents, appeared and addressed the Board. A motion was made by Mr. Maples and seconded by Mr. Ginnell to close the case with a finding of no reasonable cause. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Adkins, Eck, Epps, Ginnell, Kim, Maples, Reisinger and Rubinstein.

In the matter of FHB File Number 2010-02089, Fair Housing Board v. KBS, Inc., Warner & Associates, Timmons Group and Oakland Chase Associates, LP, the Board reviewed the record which consisted of the Final Investigative and Report and Case Analysis Recommendation and Official Consultation Memorandum Oakland Chase from the Office of the Attorney General. Andrew Sherrod,

**Minutes** 

**Public Comment** 

**Fair Housing** Administrator's Report

01052, Vicki Wells v. **Kenneth Saunders** 

FHB File Number 2010-05358, Thomas Schott v. Ursula Fletcher, Corporation, and **Mercury Associates Limited Partnership** 

FHB File Number 2010-02089, Fair Housing Board v. KBS, Inc., Warner & Associates, **Timmons Group and** Associates, LP

attorney for respondent KBS, Inc., appeared and addressed Missy Wycinsky, attorney for respondent the Board. Timmons Group, appeared and addressed the Board. Mike Rothernel, attorney for Oakland Chase Associates, LP, appeared and addressed the Board.

At 10:36 A.M., Mr. Eck offered a motion which was seconded by Mr. Maples, that the Board meeting be recessed and that the Fair Housing Board immediately reconvene in closed meeting for the purpose of consultation with legal counsel and briefings by staff members pertaining to actual or probable litigation as permitted by §2.2-3711.A.7 of the Code of Virginia. The following nonmembers will be in attendance to reasonably aid the consideration of the topic: Tom Payne, Liz Hayes and Deanda Shelton.

This motion is made with respect to the matter(s) identified as agenda item(s):

## 8. FHB File Number 2009-02089, Fair Housing Board v. KBS, Inc., Warner & Associates, Timmons Group and Oakland Chase Associates, LP

At 11:15 A.M., a motion was made by Mr. Adkins and seconded by Mr. Maples that the Board reconvene in open session.

WHEREAS, the Fair Housing Board has convened a closed **Certification** meeting on this date pursuant to an affirmative recorded vote in accordance with the provisions of the Virginia Freedom of Information Act; and

WHEREAS, §2.2-3712 of the Code of Virginia requires a certification by this Fair Housing Board that such closed meeting was conducted in conformity with Virginia law;

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the Fair Housing Board hereby certifies that, to the best of each member's knowledge, (i) only public business matters lawfully exempted from open meeting requirements by Virginia law were discussed in the closed meeting to which this certification resolution applies and (ii) only such public business matters as were identified in the motion convening the closed meeting were heard, discussed or considered by

**Closed Session** 

the Fair Housing Board.

**VOTE: 8-0** 

AYES: Adkins, Eck, Epps, Ginnell, Kim, Maples,

Reisinger and Rubinstein.

NAYS: None.

ABSENT DURING THE VOTE: None.

ABSENT DURING THE MEETING: Bhatt, Carrera and Randall.

In the matter of FHB File Number 2010-02089, Fair FHB File Number 2010-Housing Board v. KBS, Inc., Warner & Associates, Timmons Group and Oakland Chase Associates, LP, a motion was made by Mr. Rubinstein to find no reasonable cause that the respondent Warner & Associates failed to design and construct the entrance routes to the subject buildings to be handicapped accessible by persons with a disability. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Adkins, Eck, Epps, Ginnell, Kim, Maples, Reisinger and Rubinstein.

02089, Fair Housing Board v. KBS, Inc., Warner & Associates, **Timmons Group and Oakland Chase** Associates, LP

A motion was made by Mr. Eck and seconded by Mr. Maples to find reasonable cause that the respondents KBS, Inc., Timmons Group and Oakland Chase Associates, LP and Tetra Companies, LLC failed to design and construct the entrance routes to the subject buildings to be handicapped accessible by persons with a disability. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Adkins, Eck, Epps, Ginnell, Kim, Maples, Reisinger and Rubinstein.

In the matter of FHB File Number 2010-02399, David Boyd v. Jim Trousdale, Maritza Rose, Kenneth Lewis, and Bank of America Home Loans, the Board reviewed the record which consisted of the Final Investigative Report and Case Analysis and Recommendation and Supplemental Investigative Report. David Boyd, complainant, appeared and addressed the Board. A motion was made by Mr. Adkins and seconded by Mr. Ginnell to close the case with a finding of no reasonable cause. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Adkins, Epps,

FHB File Number 2010-02399, David Boyd v. Jim Trousdale, Maritza Rose, Kenneth Lewis, and Bank of America Home Loans

Ginnell, Kim, Maples, Reisinger and Rubinstein.

Due to a possible conflict of interest, Mr. Eck did not participate in discussion or vote in the matter.

The Board recessed from 11:15 A.M. to 11:25 A.M.

In the matter of FHB File Number 2010-05689, Lucinda Jones v. Betty Elmore, the Board reviewed the record which consisted of the Final Investigative Report and Case Analysis and Recommendation. Ms. Jones submitted a written statement to the Board. A motion was made by Mr. Reisinger and seconded by Ms. Epps to close the case with a finding of no reasonable cause. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Adkins, Eck, Epps, Ginnell, Kim, Maples, Reisinger and Rubinstein.

In the matter of the File Number 2010-05047, Housing Opportunities Made Equal v. Hayvir LLC, a motion was made by Mr. Ginnell and seconded by Ms. Epps to approve the terms of the conciliation agreement as agreed to by the parties. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Adkins, Eck, Epps, Ginnell, Kim, Maples, Reisinger and Rubinstein.

In the matter of the File Number 2010-04796, Darryl Johnson v. BL Assoicates, LLC, Cassandra Robertson and Crystal Palmer, a motion was made by Mr. Ginnell and seconded by Ms. Epps to approve the terms of the conciliation agreement as agreed to by the parties. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Adkins, Eck, Epps, Ginnell, Kim, Maples, Reisinger and Rubinstein.

In the matter of the File Number 2010-05058, Timothy Voightsberger v. Karen Henderson and Sea Pines, LP, a motion was made by Mr. Ginnell and seconded by Ms. Epps to approve the terms of the conciliation agreement as agreed to by the parties. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Adkins, Eck, Epps, Ginnell, Kim, Maples, Reisinger and Rubinstein.

In the matter of the File Number 2010-03596, Andrea File Number 2010-03596, Vaughan v. Tanya Lyons, Melissa Widner, and Andrea Vaughan v.

**Break** 

FHB File Number 2010-05689, Lucinda Jones v. **Betty Elmore** 

File Number 2010-05047, **Housing Opportunities** Made Equal v. Hayvir LLC

File Number 2010-04796, Darryl Johnson v. BL Assoicates, LLC, **Cassandra Robertson and Crystal Palmer** 

File Number 2010-05058, Timothy Voightsberger v. Karen Henderson and Sea Pines, LP

Northway, LP, a motion was made by Mr. Ginnell and seconded by Ms. Epps to approve the terms of the conciliation agreement as agreed to by the parties. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Adkins, Eck, Epps, Ginnell, Kim, Maples, Reisinger and Rubinstein.

<u>Tanya Lyons, Melissa</u> <u>Widner, and Northway,</u> <u>LP</u>

In the matter of the File Number 2010-05043, Housing Opportunities Made Equal of Virginia, Inc., v. James D. Otis, III, and Lynn C. Otis, a motion was made by Mr. Ginnell and seconded by Ms. Epps to approve the terms of the conciliation agreement as agreed to by the parties. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Adkins, Eck, Epps, Ginnell, Kim, Maples, Reisinger and Rubinstein.

File Number 2010-05043, Housing Opportunities Made Equal of Virginia, Inc., v. James D. Otis, III, and Lynn C. Otis

In the matter of the File Number 2010-06055, Bridgette Moats v. Jack Hurst, Owner and James M. Hurst, Owner, a motion was made by Mr. Ginnell and seconded by Ms. Epps to approve the terms of the conciliation agreement as agreed to by the parties. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Adkins, Eck, Epps, Ginnell, Kim, Maples, Reisinger and Rubinstein.

File Number 2010-06055, Bridgette Moats v. Jack Hurst, Owner and James M. Hurst, Owner

In the matter of the File Number 2010-05765, Nora Ward v. Betty Hairston, Royal Arms Associates, LP, a motion was made by Mr. Ginnell and seconded by Ms. Epps to approve the terms of the conciliation agreement as agreed to by the parties. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Adkins, Eck, Epps, Ginnell, Kim, Maples, Reisinger and Rubinstein.

File Number 2010-05765, Nora Ward v. Betty Hairston, Royal Arms Associates, LP

In the matter of the File Number 2009-01401, Norma Hutchinson v. M.W.A., Inc., d/b/a Alls & Company, and Malcolm W. Alls, a motion was made by Mr. Ginnell and seconded by Mr. Eck to approve the settlement terms as presented. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Adkins, Eck, Epps, Ginnell, Kim, Maples, Reisinger and Rubinstein.

File Number 2009-01401, Norma Hutchinson v. M.W.A., Inc., d/b/a Alls & Company, and Malcolm W. Alls

In the matter of FHB File Number 2008-04043, Patricia Walsh v. Briarwood Hearth Owner's Association, the Board reviewed the settlement conference information.

FHB File Number 2008-04043, Patricia Walsh v. Briarwood Hearth Owner's Association

At 11:45 A.M., Ms. Epps offered a motion which was Closed Session seconded by Mr. Adkins, that the Board meeting be recessed and that the Fair Housing Board immediately reconvene in closed meeting for the purpose of consultation with legal counsel and briefings by staff members pertaining to actual or probable litigation as permitted by §2.2-3711.A.7 of the Code of Virginia. The following nonmembers will be in attendance to reasonably aid the consideration of the topic: Tom Payne and Liz Hayes.

This motion is made with respect to the matter(s) identified as agenda item(s):

## 19. FHB File Number 2009-02089, Fair Housing Board v. KBS, Inc., Warner & Associates, Timmons Group and Oakland Chase Associates, LP

At 12:38 P.M., a motion was made by Mr. Adkins and seconded by Mr. Eck that the Board reconvene in open session.

WHEREAS, the Fair Housing Board has convened a closed meeting on this date pursuant to an affirmative recorded vote in accordance with the provisions of the Virginia Freedom of Information Act; and

Certification

WHEREAS, §2.2-3712 of the Code of Virginia requires a certification by this Fair Housing Board that such closed meeting was conducted in conformity with Virginia law;

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the Fair Housing Board hereby certifies that, to the best of each member's knowledge, (i) only public business matters lawfully exempted from open meeting requirements by Virginia law were discussed in the closed meeting to which this certification resolution applies and (ii) only such public business matters as were identified in the motion convening the closed meeting were heard, discussed or considered by the Fair Housing Board.

**VOTE: 8-0** 

AYES: Adkins, Eck, Epps, Ginnell, Kim, Maples, Reisinger and Rubinstein.

NAYS: None.

ABSENT DURING THE VOTE: None.

ABSENT DURING THE MEETING: Bhatt, Carrera and Randall.

In the matter of FHB File Number 2008-04043, Patricia Walsh v. Briarwood Hearth Owner's Association, a motion was made by Mr. Maples and seconded by Mr. Ginnell to designate Liz Hayes as the Board's representative for the settlement conference pertaining to FHB File Number 2008-04043, Patricia Walsh v. Briarwood Hearth Owner's Association. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Adkins, Eck, Epps, Ginnell, Kim, Maples, Reisinger and Rubinstein.

FHB File Number 2008-04043, Patricia Walsh v. **Briarwood Hearth Owner's Association** 

A motion was made by Mr. Eck and seconded by Mr. Eck Education to accept the September 29, 2010, Education Committee Report. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Adkins, Eck, Epps, Ginnell, Kim, Maples, Reisinger and Rubinstein.

A motion was made by Mr. Eck and seconded by Mr. Kim to authorize Board staff to rescind the pending Notice Of Intended Regulatory Action (NOIRA) for General Review of Fair Housing Regulations and re-issue a NOIRA for general review of Fair Housing Regulations. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were Adkins, Eck, Epps, Ginnell, Kim, Maples, Reisinger Rubinstein.

P	٧d	lm	ın	181	tra	tiv	e	ISS	ue	es

The Board adjourned at 12:45 p.m.

David B. Rubinstein, Chairman

Gordon Dixon, Secretary